

SBF Project Completion Note

Türkiye: COVID-19 Vaccine Project under the CRF

1. Project Information

Project ID:	P000640	Instrument ID:	L0640A
Member:	Türkiye	Region:	Western Asia
Sector:	CRF-Public Health	Sub-sector:	N/A
Instrument type:	Loan	E&S category:	B
Co-financier(s):	World Bank		
Borrower:	Republic of Türkiye		
Guarantor:	Not Applicable		
Implementing Agency:	Ministry of Health, Türkiye		
Project Team Leader(s):	Zhaojing Mu, PTL		
Project Team Members:	Yannan Jia, Project admin Rizal Rivai, OSD - Procurement Specialist Yang Shuai, OSD - Environment & Social Development Specialist Bernardita Saez, Project Counsel Rui Xiang, OSD - Financial Management Specialist Dong Mei, Team Member		
Site Visits by AIIB:	June, 2022		

2. Project Summary and Objectives

The project, co-financed with the World Bank, with the objectives of enabling affordable and equitable access to COVID-19 vaccines in Türkiye and helping ensure effective vaccine deployment by strengthening the vaccination system, was financed under the AIIB's COVID-19 Crisis Recovery Facility (CRF) in the amount of EUR225.347 million. The Project comprises the vaccine procurement and communication campaign. The implementation period was from July 2022 to December 2023.

3. Key Dates

Approval:	June 29, 2022	Signing:	July 4, 2022
Effective:	Aug. 1, 2022	Restructured (if any):	
Orig. Closing:	Dec. 31, 2023	Rev. Closing (if any):	

Final Maturity Date	Feb. 15, 2053	
---------------------	---------------	--

4. Disbursement Summary (Euro million)

a) Committed:	225.35	b) Cancelled (if any):	0.00
c) Disbursed:	225.35	d) Last disbursement: (amount /date)	22.53 / Dec. 22, 2022
e) Undisbursed (if any):	0.00	f) Disbursement Ratio (%) ¹ :	100.00

5. Estimated and Actual Costs

Item	Total Estimated Costs	Total Actual Costs	Financing Allocation			
			AIIB Original Commitment (Share %)	AIIB Actual Commitment (Share %)	WB's Original Budget (Share %)	WB's Actual Cost (Share %)
Vaccines	675,300,000	675,547,000	30	33	61	61
Awareness Campaign	747,000	500,000	3	0	6	6
Total	676 million	676 million	33	33	67	67

6. Project Implementation, including major changes to the original Objective, Project Design, and Indicators

The Ministry of Health (MoH) was the sole implementing entity for the Project. The MoH, through the existing Project Management and Supervision Unit (PMSU), (i) was responsible for the technical aspects of vaccine inspection, storage, registration, deployment, and monitoring; (ii) provided technical inputs to vaccine procurement and payment transactions and implementation support to the Devlet Malzeme Ofisi (DMO, State Supply Office) to strengthen its capacity to manage and deliver project activities; (iii) helped address technical issues that may arise during implementation; and (iv) was responsible for solely implementing safeguard policies and guidelines, preparing semi-annual project reports, and monitoring project performance and achievements under the results framework.

Components	Physical Progress*	Environmental & Social Compliance	Procurement
------------	--------------------	-----------------------------------	-------------

¹ Disbursement Ratio is defined as the volume (i.e. the dollar amount) of total disbursed amount as a percentage of the net committed volume, i.e., $f = c / (a - b)$

Vaccines procurement	N/A	<p>The Environmental and Social (ES) Audit was conducted by the independent ES consultants in October 2022 and evaluated as satisfactory.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The ES instruments, Environmental and Social Commitment Plan, Environmental and Social Management Framework, and Stakeholder Engagement Plan have been finalized by the MoH and disclosed (in English and Turkish) in April 2022. 2. The MoH has one Senior Environmental Expert and one Senior Social Specialist working in the PMSU to monitor the Project's ES compliance during implementation. The two experts are also responsible for supervising Occupational Health and Safety and waste management risks. A waste management specialist from the respective unit of MoH has been trained and assigned to support PMSU in the provision of information on the status of implementation of site-specific Waste Management Plans for Hospitals. 3. The Environmental and Social Management Framework and its subsidiary instruments, including Labor Management Procedures and Waste Management Plans for Hospitals have been under implementation and monitoring and evaluated as compliant, with one recommendation that the implementation of the Waste Management Plans should be improved to minimize the exposure risks of employees on site from the sharp wastes during the transfer of waste bags. 	The vaccine contracts were reviewed and considered acceptable
----------------------	-----	---	---

Financial Management:

The PMSU has adequate internal controls in place in which there is a clear segregation of duties between the procurement function and payment function. The accounting entries are made based on the payment confirmation. The PMSU maintains the records for the Project including the retroactively financed part to ensure appropriate accounting for the funds provided for the Project. The audit report covers from the date of loan signing to Dec. 31, 2022.

7. Implementation of Environmental and Social Policy and project specific E&S instruments, including the project level Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)

The World Bank (WB)'s Environmental and Social Framework (ESF), as well as ESSs under ESF applied to the Project. To ensure a harmonized approach to addressing ES aspects of the Project, and as permitted by AIIB's Environmental and Social Policy (AIIB's ESP), WB's ESF and ESSs applied to the Project in lieu of AIIB's ESP. AIIB has reviewed WB ESSs and was satisfied with (i) WB's ESF and ESSs are consistent with

AIIB's Articles of Agreement and materially consistent with the provisions of AIIB's ESP and the relevant ESSs, and (ii) the monitoring procedures in place are appropriate for the Project. The ES instruments including the ES Commitment Plan, ES Management Framework (including the Labor Management Procedures), and Stakeholder Engagement Plan, were disclosed by the MoH in April 2022.

The PMSU has established a project-specific GRM which is functioning. The MoH Communication Center, the Meeting Point in Health, the Presidency Contact Center, Patient Rights' Boards in public hospitals, and the PMSU's webpage are the main channels through which MoH collects community feedback on grievances, complaints and suggestions related with the COVID-19 Emergency Health project. Once received, the feedback is categorized according to the content and shared with the relevant MoH department or health care service provider (such as hospitals, family medicine centers, etc.).

The GRM also allows workers to promptly inform management of labor issues, such as a lack of personal protective equipment, unreasonable overtime, stress, and any Sexual Exploitation and Abuse/Sexual Harassment issues in the workplace. This workers' GRM allows for anonymous grievances and has an appeal process in place.

8. Results Achieved (Against the original indicators and/or revised indicators. RMF table will be exported on the last page of this PCN.)

All three Project Objective Indicators surpassed their end targets. The government's significant investment in treatment equipment was instrumental in one indicator (diagnosed cases treated per approved protocol under the Project) in surpassing its end target. Regardless of the source of financing (Bank or Government), the share of treated cases had a remarkable increase. All the Intermediate Results Indicators met or surpassed their end target values.

9. Investment Sustainability (operational, financial/commercial, institutional)

The key strengths anchoring Türkiye's longer-term debt sustainability remain as reflected in the moderate levels of public debt (around 40 percent of gross domestic product), a track record of conservative fiscal policies, as well as a large, diversified economy with a young population and an entrepreneurial spirit which translates into substantial growth potential.

10. Compliance and Alignment with AIIB's Policies and Strategic Priorities

The Project has complied with AIIB's Policies, e.g., the Operational Financing Policy, and was aligned with AIIB's commitment to supporting members' emergency public healthcare financing needs to respond to the COVID-19 crisis through the Facility. It aligned with the Facility as a co-financed project with WB. AIIB benefited from WB's experience and presence in the country as well as from its long-standing support to the Borrower's health sector development that has been incorporated in the project design. The Loan demonstrated AIIB's responsiveness to the pressing demands of its members in general, and Türkiye in particular.

11. Any outstanding issues not yet resolved, if applicable

NA

12. Lessons learned that can be considered for future investments

Lesson Tag	Lesson Description
Project Management	<p>The implementation of streamlined procedures, coupled with a flexible project design and intensified efforts by counterparts and the project team, has proven to be instrumental in driving progress. This is especially relevant to emergency loans which are urgent in nature.</p> <p>Intensified efforts by the project team have been instrumental in achieving the objectives and results. During COVID-19, when travel was restricted, the project team had weekly virtual calls with all counterparties to ensure the implementation was on the right track.</p> <p>Overall, the above factors have contributed to the progress achieved and can serve as valuable insights for future projects, especially for emergency support projects.</p>

13. Borrower's Feedback

Based on the feedback received from the government through virtual calls and the questionnaire, the overall performance is commended as a high level of satisfaction. Project Preparation was considered effective and supportive during the project preparation phase. The project team demonstrated a strong understanding of the Borrower's needs and priorities, resulting in a well-designed project that aligned with the government's demands. The project team was praised for the proactive and efficient management of project implementation. The Borrower appreciated the timely provision of capacity-building support by the Bank. The Borrower and Implementing Agencies expressed satisfaction with the quality of project outputs and outcomes, highlighting the positive impact on the target beneficiaries.

14. Achievement of Project Results

The Project achieved its objectives in supporting the health system to prevent, detect, and respond to the threat posed by COVID-19 and emergencies in Türkiye, which had a positive impact on Türkiye's efforts to mitigate COVID-19 pandemic and the earthquake response.

Annex: Client Feedback on the Project

The Project Team should design a questionnaire and provide it to the Borrower and the Implementing Entities to help collect feedback from the client. Below is a list of suggested questions for the questionnaire.

1. Are the services and support provided by the Project Team professional, sufficient and in time, during project preparation and project implementation? Please provide some specifics or examples as an illustration.

Yes, the team has conducted the necessary coordination works without any disruptions due to the adequate number of qualified personnel.

The project team has consistently provided professional support during both the project preparation and implementation stages. At the beginning of the project preparation stage, an experienced team was formed, fostering a cordial relationship and establishing a regular review mechanism. Furthermore, the project team ensures sufficient support throughout the project's preparation and implementation.

Moreover, the project team understands the urgency of the client's needs, particularly in light of the COVID-19 pandemic. They provided timely support by efficiently communicating with the client and obtaining direct feedback. They addressed the core themes of the project and facilitate the internal approval process to ensure timely support.

Overall, the project team's professionalism, sufficiency, and timeliness in providing support during project preparation and implementation have been instrumental in ensuring the success and effectiveness of the project.

2. Is it convenient to access to the Project Team's services and support? Please provide some specifics or examples as an illustration.

Yes, prompt communication through emails and timely, effective, and efficient feedback enabled swift actions to be taken. The project team maintains prompt communication through efficient email correspondence. The team takes swift actions when necessary, demonstrating their commitment to addressing any issues or concerns that may arise.

3. Does the Project Team demonstrate flexibility and efficiency during project preparation and project implementation? Please provide some specifics or examples as an illustration.

Yes, a portion of the retroactive financing was increased for vaccine procurement.

Overall, the project team's ability to adapt and provide efficient services contributes to the success and smooth implementation of the project.

4. What is the value addition of AIIB's financing in the Project?

AIIB provided smooth coordination and additional financing to ensure sufficient support to the government of Türkiye. This demonstrates the effectiveness of the program in providing timely and necessary financial support to companies in need.

5. Will you consider working with the AIIB again in infrastructure development? Please provide a few specific reasons.

Yes, the project was successfully closed through highly effective and efficient collaboration. We are excited about further enhancing cooperation with AIIB, with a specific focus on health investments.

6. Do you have any suggestion to the Project Team and/or the AIIB for them to improve their operations in the future?

The Project that was carried out under effective collaboration was successfully closed.

We appreciate AIIB's high level of expertise and experience, which directly contributes to the success of the project through knowledge sharing and capacity building, as well as the utilization of resources efficiently.

As a result, we do not have any further recommendations, as AIIB already demonstrates several key strengths.

7. Other comments, such as comments on the reporting requirements, approval of project change.
AIIB's efforts in matching co-financier, which ensures that projects are well-planned and aligned with project development goals. We also recognize the importance of timely project implementation, which is a key advantage of AIIB's streamlined project review and approval process.

Project Objective Indicators	Indicator level	Unit of Measure	Cumulative Target Values											Frequency	Responsibility	Comments
			Baseline		2022		2023		2024		End Target					
			Year	Value	Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Year	Target	Actual			
Percentage of population vaccinated, which is included in the priority population targets defined in national plan (by gender)	Project	Percentage	2022	62.90	62.90	62.90	66.00	68.90	66.0	69.00	2023	66.00	66.00			
Percentage of population vaccinated, which is included in the priority population targets defined in national plan (male)	Project	Percentage	2022	61.30	61.30	61.90	65.30	65.30	65.30	68.40	2023	65.30	65.30			
Percentage of population vaccinated,	Project	Percentage	2022	62.70	62.70	63.30	66.70	66.70	66.70	67.60	2023	66.70	66.70			

which is included in the priority population targets defined in national plan (female)																	
Number of people tested for COVID-19 identification per approved protocol under the Project (cumulative)	Project	Number	2022	0.00	0.00	93576 00.00	30000 0.00	93576 00.00	30000 00.00	93576 00.00	2023	30000 0.00	93576 00.00				
Diagnosed cases treated per approved protocol under the Project (cumulative)	Project	Percentage	2022	0.00	0.00	14.93 14.93	14.93 25.00	25.00 25.00	25.00 65.74	25.00 65.74	2023	25.00 25.00	25.00 25.00				

			Cumulative Target Values						
			Baseline	2022	2023	2024	End Target		

Project Intermediate Indicators	Indicator level	Unit of Measure	Year	Value	Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Year	Target	Actual	Frequency	Responsibility	Comments
Number of laboratories with COVID-19 diagnostic equipment, test kits, and reagents under the Project	Project	Number	2022	0.00	0.00	300.00	35.00	300.00	35.00	300.00	2023	35.00	300.00			
Number of ICU beds equipped with mechanical ventilators procured under the Project (cumulative)	Project	Number	2022	0.00	0.00	4000.00	3500.00	4000.00	3500.00	4000.00	2023	3500.00	4000.00			

Number of health staff equipped with Personal Protective Equipment (PPEs) procured under the Project	Project	Number	2022	0.00	0.00	831215.00	90000.00	831215.00	90000.00	831215.00	2023	90000.00	831215.00			
Country has reported to have contextualized their risk communication and community engagement strategies	Project	Yes/No	2022	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	2023	Yes	Yes			
Established and functioning M&E system supporting epidemic preparedness and response	Project	Yes/No	2022	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	2023	Yes	Yes			
Vaccine stock management tools and																

operating procedures updated to reflect the characteristics of COVID-19 vaccines	Project	Yes/No	2022	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	2023	Yes	Yes			
Standard operating procedures (SOPs) or guidelines established for collection and disposal of medical waste to the relevant stakeholders	Project	Yes/No	2022	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	2023	Yes	Yes			