

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH ALATAU CITY AKIMAT

INTERVIEWEE	Talgat Orazbekov (Alatau City Land Department) Талгат Оразбеков (Земельный департамент города Алатау)
INTERVIEWER	Nurlan
ENUMERATOR	Pei Fang Chua
DATE	17 January 2025
TIME	1130 to 1230

Topic Guide	Suggested Questions	Interview Notes
<p>Clarifications on list of affected land plots</p> <p>Разъяснения по перечню затрагиваемых земельных участков</p>	<p>Change in list of affected land plots in Alatau from 112 to 48. Why?</p>	<p>Initial (112) after KTZ checked -&gt; 48. From their calculations number of plots affected is over 60.</p> <p>Changed to 48 but with new, finalised boundary received from KTZ there should be over 60 land plots affected.</p> <p>The number of land plots affected will be finalised by the end of the month.</p> <p>The process is still in play as they are trying to find a solution to be able to optimise the boundaries to decrease impacts on households. Alatau has proposed E.g. moving boundary north to decrease the number of land plots available.</p> <p>Awaiting KTZ approval.</p> <p>Changes—households registered before 2013 (not digitalised in current system). If the households are registered after 2013, they are digitised.</p>
	<p>What are the types of cases or scenarios for which acquisition is not required?</p> <p>В каких случаях или сценариях приобретение не требуется?</p>	<p>Acquisition is not required when</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Renting from the state</li> </ul> <p>Acquisition is required only when the land plot is privately owned.</p>
	<p>What are the circumstances for persons which have no cadastral numbers tagged to them in the list of land plots identified to be affected under Alatau City's administration?</p> <p>В каких обстоятельствах находятся лица, за которыми не закреплены кадастровые номера в перечне земельных участков, подлежащих влиянию административного управления города Алатау?</p>	<p>Not registered in the current digital system. Registered before 2013.</p> <p>There is no regulatory requirement for households to register in the system, unless they are planning to sell the land plot (new land purchases have to be registered with the Akimat) since 2013.</p>

Topic Guide	Suggested Questions	Interview Notes
<p>Transfer of land plots from Iliy and Talgar</p> <p>Передача земельных участков из Илия и Талгара</p>	<p>Is the transfer of land plots to Alatau City complete?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>If not, what are the challenges faced, and how long would the transfer take?</li> <li>How many have been transferred, and how many are pending?</li> </ul> <p>Завершена ли передача земельных участков в «Алатау Сити»?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Если нет, то с какими трудностями вы столкнетесь и сколько времени займет перевод?</li> <li>Сколько из них было переведено, а сколько находится на рассмотрении?</li> </ul>	<p>Yes, the transfer is complete. However, they do not have the contact information, addresses, demographic information, etc for the affected land plots.</p> <p>To be able to obtain the contact numbers, the Akimat will need to contact the tax committee and the police department.</p> <p>How long will it take to facilitate obtaining the contact numbers and addresses of the people?</p> <p>He needs to get an order from the head of the Akimat to be able to process this and arrange meetings. He doesn't think we are able to conduct meetings next week. We need to provide a letter to the head of the Akimat to ask for assistance for the social surveys next week. Then, he is able to arrange the meetings.</p>
	<p>For the land plots transferred to Alatau City, what is the process like? Do decrees have to be re-issued? Does the negotiation process start again?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For those whose residences (houses which they live in) are not affected.</li> <li>For those whose residences are affected.</li> </ul> <p>Как происходит процесс передачи земельных участков в АО «Алатау Сити»? Нужно ли переиздавать указы? Начинается ли переговорный процесс вновь?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Для тех, чье жилье (дома, в которых они живут) не затронуто.</li> <li>Для тех, чье жилье пострадало.</li> </ul>	<p>Decrees have already been issued in mid-December for 112 land plots.</p> <p>If the land plots which are to be acquired in the final boundary are already within the 112 land plots, no new decree will be issued.</p> <p>If new land plots are to be acquired beyond the 112 for which the decree was issued, a new decree will be issued.</p> <p>For land plots that end up not being acquired, a new decree will be issued to inform the landowners regarding the remaining land plots which are not acquired.</p>
	<p>What is the status of land acquisition for the land plots identified?</p>	<p>Acquisition has started since the decree has been issued. They are planning to organise a tender to contract valuers. All are pending. However, the boundaries are still to be defined. Some are already acquired from Iliy and Talgar akimat (just transfer between akimats).</p> <p><i>Asked for the list for the 112 regarding the status of land acquisition.</i></p>
	<p>How will any ongoing grievances or grievances that arise from Iliy</p>	<p>For court cases:</p>

Topic Guide	Suggested Questions	Interview Notes
	<p>District's or Talgar District's administration be handled?</p> <p>Как будут решаться текущие претензии или претензии, возникающие со стороны администрации Илийского района или Талгарского района?</p>	<p>Land acquisition through the court must be completed by Iliy or Talgar (after which they are transferred to Alatau)</p> <p>In cases of negotiation with Akimats: Alatau Akimat will take over the process of negotiation.</p>
<p>Land plots yet to be notified</p> <p>Земельные участки еще не нотифицированы</p>	<p>For land plots which are newly identified (and which need to be acquired), what is the acquisition process like?</p> <p>Как происходит процесс приобретения земельных участков, которые были определены недавно (и которые необходимо приобрести)?</p> <p>What are the means through which affected persons can raise complaints or grievances?</p> <p>С помощью каких средств пострадавшие лица могут подавать жалобы или жалобы?</p>	<p>Acquisition process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The same as other districts, subject to the Land Code.</li> </ul>
<p>Project boundaries</p> <p>Границы проекта</p>	<p>How has the change in Project boundaries impacted land use for Alatau City?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Any communal grazing lands impacted? Any changes in seasonal grazing patterns or designated communal routes due to the Project?</li> <li>Any planned developments/land use affected due to the Project?</li> </ul> <p>Как изменение границ проекта повлияло на землепользование в городе Алатау?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Пострадали ли какие-либо общинные пастбища? Будут ли какие-либо изменения в сезонных схемах выпаса скота или выделенных маршрутах общего пользования в связи с проектом?</li> <li>Затронуты ли какие-либо запланированные разработки/землепользование в связи с проектом?</li> </ul>	<p>Offered to KTZ to move the Project north so they do not need to acquire so many affected landplots (households only), not other types of land use.</p>
<p>Physical displacement</p> <p>Физическое перемещение</p>	<p>Of all the affected land plots in Alatau City, how many houses (which people use as their primary residence) are being affected? How many have already been acquired?</p>	<p>They do not have any information on the number of people living on the land plots. Only the landowner is registered, they do not have any information on unregistered</p>

Topic Guide	Suggested Questions	Interview Notes
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Number of households which registered land use as residential</li> <li>Number of households which have not registered their land use as residential. Why do these households not register their land use as residential? (please provide an estimate if there are no official records)</li> </ul> <p>Сколько из всех пострадавших земельных участков в городе Алатау пострадали? Сколько их уже приобретено?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Количество домохозяйств, зарегистрировавших землепользование как жилое</li> <li>Количество домохозяйств, которые не зарегистрировали свое землепользование как жилое. Почему эти домохозяйства не оформляют свое землепользование как жилое?</li> </ul> <p>(пожалуйста, предоставьте оценку, если нет официальных записей)</p>	<p>residents. They will only negotiate with the registered landowner.</p> <p>Compensation will not happen if the land is not registered as for residency use.</p> <p>According to the legislation, people have one year to register their ownership with the state.</p> <p>If persons who have not completed the registration process are revealed in the process of land acquisition, the land acquisition department helps the person to complete that as soon as possible. (this happens with or without the Project)</p> <p>Usually people register before the one-year deadline.</p>
	<p>What is the process of acquiring land from households who have to resettle elsewhere due to the Project?</p> <p>Каков процесс приобретения земли у домохозяйств, которые вынуждены переселяться в другие места в связи с проектом?</p> <p>How is it different from acquiring land from those who do not have to resettle elsewhere?</p> <p>Чем это отличается от приобретения земли у тех, кому не нужно переселяться куда-то еще?</p>	<p>The process of land acquisition depends on the registered purpose of the land use.</p> <p>For those who are not using the land plots for the registered purposes, the owner, if found, will be fined.</p> <p>Residential plots will be compensated based on the valuator's evaluation. Valuers may value residential plots differently (according to the market conditions).</p>
	<p>Are there any differences in the principles of valuation for areas considered to be rural versus those considered to be urban (in the city)?</p>	<p>Up to the valuator. Difference in prices. Prices of land plots in Alatau City have increased (due to market forces) after the announcement of Alatau City.</p>
<p>Presence of unregistered users Наличие незарегистрированных пользователей</p>	<p>How many unregistered users are present on the affected land plots in Alatau City? Please provide estimates if there are no official records.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>What do they use the land for? Please provide estimates on the number of users for each type of land use</li> </ul>	<p>No information on unregistered users.</p>

Topic Guide	Suggested Questions	Interview Notes
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Where do they move to if the land is acquired?</li> </ul> <p>Сколько незарегистрированных пользователей присутствует на пострадавших земельных участках в г. Алатау?</p> <p>Пожалуйста, приведите смету, если нет официальных данных.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Для чего они используют землю? Просьба представить оценки численности пользователей по каждому типу землепользования</li> <li>Куда они переезжают, если земля приобретается?</li> </ul>	
<p>Preferences and use of compensation received</p> <p>Предпочтения и использование полученной компенсации</p>	<p>How do affected households prefer to be compensated and why? (e.g. replacement land plot vs cash)</p> <p>Как пострадавшие домохозяйства предпочитают получать компенсацию и почему? (например, замещающий земельный участок или наличные)</p>	<p>They prefer cash generally. The replacement plot is not easy to get. According to the Land Code, households that prefer replacement land plots should be provided by Akimat (in the same area and similar conditions). The people are aware that it is difficult to get a land plot of similar conditions. People prefer to make the decisions themselves.</p>
	<p>For households which have been compensated, how have they used their compensation?</p> <p>Что касается домохозяйств, получивших компенсацию, то как они использовали свою компенсацию?</p> <p>Please provide estimates on number or percentage of households for each type of use where possible.</p> <p>Просьба представить оценки количества или процентной доли домашних хозяйств по каждому типу использования, где это возможно.</p>	<p>They are not aware as they do not intervene in that or collect information on that.</p> <p>It depends on situations: e.g. residential plots usually buy another house. Some deposit the compensation in banks to wait for better prices. Some decide to buy an empty plot of land and construct houses.</p>
<p>Nature of grievances</p> <p>Характер жалоб</p>	<p>What is the nature of any grievances/complaints/concerns raised for those whose lands are being acquired?</p> <p>Каков характер любых жалоб/жалоб/опасений, возникающих в отношении тех, чьи земли приобретаются?</p>	<p>Not yet</p>
	<p>What is the nature of any grievances/complaints/concerns raised by those living in Alatau City?</p>	<p>Have not received any complaints. People are supportive of the project due to the infrastructural development and are expecting that the bridge over the existing railway can be used. Currently</p>

Topic Guide	Suggested Questions	Interview Notes
	Каков характер любых жалоб/жалоб/опасений, высказанных жителями города Алатау?	people (and vehicles) are using a level crossing, sometimes it takes half an hour.

*Please request the information below based on the list of affected land plots in Alatau City. For each row, cadastral number, or land plot that meets the specified criteria, highlight it accordingly.*

Of the affected land plots in Alatau City, please provide information on:

- Households profiled as vulnerable:
  - women-headed households
  - households consisting of only post-retirement age members
  - households with persons with disabilities
- low-income households

The Alatau Land Department does not have information on the socioeconomic status or demographic information on the affected households.

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH ILIY DISTRICT LAND DEPARTMENT

STAKEHOLDER	Iliy District Land Department Representative
DATE	07 and 08 November 2024
TIME	10:40 AM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview

### General information:

In the population, there are about 70% Muslim and 30% Christian Orthodox. The common languages spoken are about 50 / 50 Russian Kazakh. About 40% of the people live on private land whereas 60% live on leased land – both in rural and urban areas. There are Multi National Company employment opportunities in the area, for example, Philip Morris, GTI, Danone. Iliy District is also a Logistics Hub, and a warehouse for Toyota. There is a Regional Hospital, and schools which are private/state owned. The quality of the private school and hospitals are better than the state, but in Almaty City it is much better in comparison.

Topic	Notes
What is the view on KTZ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The general view of KTZ is a positive one.</li><li>• The existing railway brings access to the city. Trains and cargo trains cross Iliy District every 40 minutes. It goes internationally.</li><li>• There have been no incidents or problems that she is aware of.</li><li>• KTZ bring new employment opportunities to the youth.</li><li>• The Iliy Akimat has not requested for KTZ's support or help in other CSR projects.</li><li>• Their first request would be to improve access roads to certain private homes. There is an issue with fencing from land plots to railway tracks.</li></ul>
What is the view about the project having a Grievance mechanism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The respondent is aware of the project having a Grievance mechanism.</li><li>• Landowners where fragmented land has occurred have asked the District Akimat where the cattle passes would be and if it would be close to their homes. They have also asked for noise mitigation screens to reduce noise.</li><li>• These owners apply to the Akimat and the Akimat then requests this to KTZ. KTZ said they would install it. The Akimats ask that the grievances are written so they can share it with KTZ.</li></ul>
What are the views on Needs assessment?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• What could be improved in the area are sport clubs and sport facilities. Furthermore, she wishes KTZ could support in the development of sport facilities, in the construction of hospitals, schools, sport facilities.</li><li>• She wishes KTZ would be involved in the development of a school. As there are only 200 teachers per 1200 students (80% of teachers are women). 20% of the youths are unemployed.</li><li>• Respondent is not aware of any crime or security issues</li></ul>
Other general observations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• About 50% landowners do not live in the Akimat and several are in Almaty. Some people have given their land to tenant cultivators- the land department has no records of this. When the land is acquired, the tenants move.</li><li>• 5-6 are legal entities (land owners) and not individuals</li><li>• In cases where the land has been pledged as collateral against bank loans, there can be two situations: a) If the compensation amount is larger and the borrowing is small, the owners can</li></ul>

Topic	Notes
	<p>take another loan, pay off the debt, release the land and then pay back the loan after receiving the compensation; b) if the compensation amount is smaller than the loan, then a three-party arrangement can be made between the Akimat, Bank and Owner, to release the land to the Project. The choice is with the owner and most prefer the first method as the second method is public and most people do not want to disclose such details. The Akimat is only aware of one such case (second option) and they are keen to close this case before the end of the year.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 7 women owners in the list for Iliy, of which one may have a disability but need to confirm if she has the official certificate for it</li> <li>• Land owners give their land on rent to others to cultivate if they do not live there, or have other main occupations. Some do it in exchange for money(rent) and others for a share of the produce. Some rent out their land to avoid the government asking for it to be returned if it is not being used. Some people leave their land fallow for a period for it to recover after some years of production. In her opinion, land is available to take on rent but the better quality land with irrigation is more in demand and goes for a higher price. In her understanding, most of the land taken for the project is not the best quality (for agriculture).</li> <li>• In cases where there are tenants, they are allowed to harvest before the land is taken for Project activities</li> <li>• Sale of land by the male owner requires the written consent by the wife even if the land is in the name of the husband. This is not required for land being acquired.</li> <li>• 15% of the land owners are above retirement age. This may be due to the tax exemption given to senior citizens. Some people buy land in their parents' name to utilise this exemption.</li> </ul>



## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH KARASAY DISTRICT LAND DEPARTMENT

STAKEHOLDER	Karasay District Land Department Representative
DATE	05 November 2024
TIME	04:00 PM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with Karasay District, Land Acquisition Department

Topic	Notes
Regarding land-based activities and movement of people in Karasay District	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The respondent mentioned that there is a trend of rural to urban migration in the district. There have been cases where the owner of the land has given the land plot for industrial use, and the land use has changed from agricultural use to industrial use. In this case, the livelihood of the people affected change completely.</li> <li>During process of land acquisition (not specific to this Project) there are other owners who chose a replacement plot instead, and continue with agriculture.</li> <li>The respondent estimates that 30-40% of people prefer replacement options of compensation. The rest of the people prefer urban livelihoods and change to urban/industrial livelihoods. For youth, they prefer urban livelihoods.</li> <li>In Karasay, the presence of MNCs exist. He cited examples of Coca-cola (with over 2000 employees), Apple logistics Hub and KTNG.</li> </ul>
Income comparison of urban vs. rural	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Urban incomes are fixed monthly incomes whereas rural incomes depend more on the revenue if you use or own land. There are more efforts involved in rural livelihoods, however, the respondent highlighted that this is a personal choice.</li> <li><u>Regarding risks associated with Agriculture and Cattle:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The respondent suggested there are risks involved. He mentioned that the older generation are more experienced with livelihood and how to manage it. He also mentioned that there are government subsidies for farmers.</li> </ul> </li> <li><u>Subsidies for rural agriculture:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Respondent suggests that a portion of the population (older generation) are looking for support programs to start their own businesses.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Urban to rural migration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Regarding how the subsidy may affect urban to rural migration</u></li> <li>There are barriers to access the capital and finance for subsidies. For example, those who had previously had agricultural experience would be able to access these subsidies should they choose to migrate back from urban to rural.</li> <li>Those without previous agriculture experience could not access these subsidies and start agriculture businesses after the age of 50+.</li> </ul>
Immigration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The respondent notes that immigration of labour force is coming from Uzbekistan and China (investors). However, the labour force mainly consists of local residents.</li> <li>He suggests there is migrant capital, but not much labour capital.</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>When asked if the local labour was sufficient, he responded that the government gives subsidies for businesses.</li> </ul>
Almaty Bypass Project specific questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The respondent states that the land acquisition process started last year, and that the plan was to finish acquisition this year (2024).</li> <li>All relevant affected households have been informed.</li> <li>The respondent answered that usually at the time of notification, owners/users would have sufficient time to end current activities.</li> <li>There are 5 affected land plots in Karasay where acquisition is required: 3 are under private ownership, and 2 are leased. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For the 3 under private ownership, 2 have requested reconfiguration (1 under industrial use, the other once has been compensated estimated at 15 million tengge due to having existing structures), and 1 has been compensated an estimated 9 million tengge as it was agriculture land and the amount of land acquired determines the amount of compensation received.</li> <li>For the 2 under lease agreement, there was "zero" compensation, as the land was returned to the state. There were no crops, no assets and no structures.</li> </ul> </li> <li>It was highlighted in the meeting that compensation had not yet been fully completed. There is a need to register additional land plot for the land plot that has requested reconfiguration.</li> <li>Construction has only started where compensation is complete.</li> </ul>
Valuation process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The respondent explains that when the Valuator values a land plot, compensations will be given if crops, assets or structures were found. If they are not found, then "assets" are not compensated.</li> <li>When a percentage of land is returned to the state, then the lease agreement between the lessee and the government is altered. In the agreement, the lessee would pay less, as they are renting less land.</li> <li>The respondent noted that the Akimats bear the transaction costs, and that there is no compensation from KTZ.</li> </ul>
Average prices of land	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Average price of agriculture land without structures :500 000 tengge / 100 sqm.</li> <li>There is a very active land market.</li> </ul>
Prospecting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>After the decree is announced, the Akimats freeze the buying / selling of lands and all the affected land plots are locked.</li> </ul>

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW ZHAMBYL LAND ACQUISITION DEPARTMENT

STAKEHOLDER	Zhambyl District Land Department Representative
DATE	07 November 2024
TIME	06:20 PM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with Land Department of Zhambyl District

**General Information:**

The KII with the representative of the Land Department of Zhambyl District, was done via phone call and followed a semi-structured approach taking reference to the KII template at District levels and adapting as necessary, following the answers given by the interviewee.

Topic	Notes
Information on land distribution in Zhambyl District	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Out of the 6 private/leased land plots affected by the project, there was one woman-headed household and one elderly lady affected. The respondent further emphasized all affected plots were private land with no tenant farmers, and with no residential purposes. All owners were using the land for farming, however none of the owners were living in Zhambyl district. Some were living in Almaty, others in Uzynagash (about 15-20 km from Zhambyl), and others in other villages.</li> <li>There was land reconfiguration for this project.</li> </ul>
Validity of Valuation Reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The validity of the Valuation report depends on whether the owner disagrees with the valuation or not. If there are disagreement, the owners can raise the issue to court which would either request for a new valuation to be conducted or lead to the agreement of the current valuation in the existing valuation report.</li> <li>The respondent mentioned that there was a mistake in one of the valuation reports pertaining to a land plot owned by "Platform A", where the initial valuation did not account for the water well that existed. This was reevaluated and the new valuation report takes into account the asset. The landowner did the reevaluation independently (engaged a Valuator himself), approached the Akimat with the new valuation, and the Akimat helped with the resolution of this without the need to go to court. The owner of "Platform A" used the eOTINISH tool to raise the grievance to express the disagreement with the initial valuation report.</li> </ul>
KTZ's involvement in other infrastructure projects in Zhambyl District	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The respondent was not aware of any other infrastructure projects done by KTZ. He did mention KTZ's consultancy involvement in a 900 ha industrial zone where there exists a railway deadlock.</li> <li>Generally, the District Akimat's experience with KTZ as project proponent has been positive, and there were no concerns or issues in relation to KTZ and its operations.</li> </ul>

- The respondent mentioned that KTZ is also involved in the service and maintenance of another bridge that is being constructed in the District. He is not aware of any CSR projects done in the District by KTZ.
  - KTZ started engagements with Zhambyl last year when they provided drawings of the land plots that needed to be acquired. After the completion of the land acquisition, KTZ would administer the registration of the land with the Akimat.
-

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW TALGAR DISTRICT LAND DEPARTMENT

STAKEHOLDER	Talgar District Land Department Representative
DATE	07 November 2024
TIME	10:00 AM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with Land Department of Talgar District

The respondent has been in the job only for the past 6 months and is not as familiar with the land acquisition cases for the Project.

Topic	Notes
Main issues faced	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The delays in compensation due to the budget sanction process related delays.</li> <li>E.g., the budget request sent is based on the early estimate of compensation, but the final value can change based on the court decision and then the budget can fall short.</li> </ul>
Retrieval and compensation of unviable land	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There is the provision in law for the land department to also take and compensate for unviable land (if this case is found to be valid) if the person makes this request to the land department. If the case is found to be valid (of the left-over land becoming unviable), then the process of acquisition and compensation has to restart with the full plot and a new compensation amount. While this is possible for the Akimat to do, he wasn't sure there were any such cases under this Project.</li> </ul>
Optimisation of land acquisition	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Typically, the land department can provide inputs to the design team and request changes to optimise land acquisition and avoid too much fragmentation and unviable plots- this may have been done for this project in the early stages, but he is not aware as he came only 6 months ago to this department.</li> <li>After the landowners receive the notification, they too can ask for adjustments - he is not aware of such cases in this Project. In the case of a railway, it may be less feasible to make such adjustments to accommodate individual owners' adjustment requests.</li> <li>He went on to describe the process as it happens practically: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Decree is issued by the Akimat</li> <li>This notice is published in local newspapers</li> <li>A notice is sent to owners at their registered address. There can be two situations for these addresses: a) Owners who have themselves provided a correct and current address, b) Problem cases where the address is not current or updated.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Verification of the addresses is the land department's job</li> <li>Once all owners are found, the evaluation is started. The Land Department floats a tender to invite valuation firms to bid. The valuation done is valid for 6 months. If the landowners request</li> </ul>

	<p>a re-valuation it has to be done, based on reasons provided- this is again valid for 6 months</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Once the parties agree, the compensation is paid. If they do not agree they can approach the court. Once the court decides, the decision is final and both parties have to accept it.</li> </ul>
Additional challenges faced	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There are problems when some owners are not traceable as their addresses have not been updated. They do not have to be from the same Akimat so tracing their address needs to be done with the help of the Police or another Department. People tend to move location without updating the address. In some cases, the owners have died and the records have not been updated.</li> </ul>
Current progress of the Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 8 plots have been completed</li> <li>• 14 are ongoing/planned.</li> <li>• Some involve reconfiguration of land- this may not be possible in many cases if there is no land available.</li> </ul>

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH KAZYBEK BEK AKIM

STAKEHOLDER	Kazybek bek Akim
DATE	05 November 2024
TIME	10:00 AM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with Kazybek bek Akim

**General information:**

Kazybek bek station is the centre where all the roads meet.

The Bypass passes through an Industrial zone. The new construction of the Bypass gave a push to the industrial zone. The Akim expects that by the end of the Bypass construction, they will start their own industrial construction. There is a provision of 500 Kv from an energy grid. There will be a “newly” created industrial zone (the current one is 2 years old) – Cumulative Impact. The Bypass will add momentum to the existing small one.

The plan to urbanise is under the state-needed budget. The railway was a source of investment to attract other investments.

Topic	Notes
Are they selling or leasing land plots in the Industrial zone?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>During the first stage, there was land acquisition for the construction of the industrial zone. Tenants could temporarily use existing land in the industrial zone.</li> <li>After 3 years, the tenants have to purchase or lease the land.</li> <li>A Permit from the State was required. Which allowed for the construction of their own facilities. To create this industrial zone, the Akimat acquired the land.</li> <li>There is an agreement that the land will not be taken back by the Government. “State-Entrepreneurship Association”.</li> </ul>
Where are the investors from?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The investors are mainly from Uzbekistan (for metals) and from China (for metals, ceramic – materials for construction).</li> </ul>
SEZ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The SEZ will also have a residential zone which would be able to house over 6000 workers. It would provide jobs for local people and support competition. It will avoid importation. Entrepreneurs will be exempted from tax. Construction materials will be free of tax.</li> <li>The land that was acquired was previously used for agriculture and pastureland. There is about 113,000 ha of agricultural land. The area is connected to a water source and a sewage system.</li> <li>Kazybek bek has a “Green area” name of a village.</li> </ul>
Is there a programme to control erosion or overgrazing?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>From the Almaty Oblast. There is no soil erosion contract.</li> <li>The people have a limit on the number of livestock they can own to avoid overgrazing. Per household, they are allowed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1 horse or 1 cow / 3 ha</li> <li>1 sheep or 1 goat / 1.5 ha</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Depending on the Region, the ration can be different. In North of Kazakhstan, they have less area as the soil is better. Here the cattle require more land.</li> <li>• The current livestock head/ ha is <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ 30 000 sheep + goats</li> <li>◦ 6 000 cows</li> <li>◦ 2 000 horses</li> </ul> </li> <li>• The residents change grazing locations twice a year to let the land regenerate.</li> <li>• The Akim has the power to make decisions based on the validation by the "Animal Veterinary Survey". The Animal Vet Survey conducts surveys twice a year where they count the number of livestock in the village and try and control the population. Each year they allow for the increase, or demand for a decrease in total number, depending on how good / fast the quality of the grassland is regenerating.</li> </ul>
In previous years, has the animal veterinarian asked people to increase or decrease the population of livestock?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The veterinarian has requested that the population of the sheep in the District to be increased to 1 million sheep.</li> </ul>
Do farmers want to increase the cattle population?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Based on Kazakh culture and their psychology, the people want to make full use of their land and increase the cattle population.</li> <li>• The Ministry of Agriculture supports farmers for animal husbandry, especially for those farmers who husband exotic cows (from Brazil, Argentina). There has been an increase of 6% in the number of animals.</li> <li>• There are a total of 500 farmers in Kazybek bek "Green Area", where there are 2 cows per person.</li> </ul>



## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH MARGULAN UNIVERSITY

STAKEHOLDER	Social Matter Expert from Margulan University (via phone call)
DATE	06 November 2024
TIME	12:19 PM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with Margulan University (Cultural Heritage)

### General Information:

The Social Matter Expert (SME) graduated from the Eurasian University in 2005 with a master's degree, and since 2006 has been employed by the University. He is currently undertaking a PhD in the Kazakh State University. The KII with the SME of Margulan University was done via phone call and followed a structured style with six main questions leading to a semi-structured flow. The following highlights adapted responses of the interviewee.

Topic	Notes
Background history of Margulan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Margulan University was originally established in 1946 during the Soviet Union era and was named the University of Science Academy of the Soviet Social Republic of Kazakhstan.</li> <li>In 1998, it was re-established. The original department for cultural heritage was divided into two institutions: The Institution of Ethnology and the Institution of Archaeology.</li> </ul>
Margulan's relation with KTZ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Margulan's relation with KTZ started in 2014 when they were engaged to conduct a cultural assessment for this project. The report No 54/20-381 on 03/12/2014 identified three archaeological sites which represented remains of structures of a later time and burial mounds relating to historical information. The SME mentioned that there was a certain legislation that changed in 2019 which established protective boundaries from earthworks for construction of railway constructions from 250m to 120m from the centre line. He explained that the first 40m corresponded to the "security zone", the second 40m corresponded to the "development control zone" and the third 40m corresponded to "nature and landscape protection zone". Further information and references of the legislations, and existing studies on the identified cultural heritage site was requested by ERM.</li> <li>The SME then mentioned that, as of the new legislation of avoiding construction within 120m from the centre line, a new assessment No 54/20-480 was done on 01/11/2024 which concluded that there were no objects of archaeological significance identified in the area.</li> </ul>
Were Margulan aware of Antique's letter and engagement?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>When asked whether Margulan was aware of KTZ's engagement with Antique, the SME mentioned that he was aware of the 2023/003 letter prepared by Antique-KZ LLP hired by Poligram LLP. The letter stated that there were 10 mounds, and 5 memorial-</li> </ul>

	<p>ritual structures historical-cultural heritage identified 150m east of the Zhamnkum wintering area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• He further mentioned that Antique and Margulan are both licensed to provide cultural assessments and technical support for construction companies to identify and study any cultural heritage impacts of the projects.</li> </ul>
Is there any likelihood for other undiscovered Cultural Heritage objects surrounding the site?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• When asked about the other possibilities of unearthing and discovering other significant Cultural Heritage objects surrounding the site, the SME mentioned that it was possible as this location has historical significance. Due to soil erosion and movement of underground water, the SME stressed that chance finds would be possible but that construction companies are aware of the rules and legislations.</li> </ul>
Compliance with National and Local regulations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The SME mentioned that it is mandatory by law to have a chance finds procedure in Kazakhstan and that construction companies should inform the Akimats' department of cultural heritage immediately after any historical object is found, which the Akimats would then visit the site and invite experts to have an assessment. The SME referred to Article 30 of the Republic of Kazakhstan, December 26, 2019 № 288-VI 3PK.</li> </ul>

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW KTZ

STAKEHOLDER	Project Manager for the Almaty Bypass, KTZ
DATE	06 November 2024
TIME	05:00 PM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with KTZ

Topic	Notes
General information about project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Since project conceptualization, there has been several designs and the designers did created options that avoided the most physical development.</li> <li>• All contractors and subcontractors have their own security personnel from their own company on site, and they do not carry firearms. So there are no contracts with security agencies.</li> <li>• There is no GBVH policy for KTZ but there has been a recent national law that protects women from discrimination. KTZ employs several women in various roles and there is no discrimination in the company.</li> <li>• KTZ informed that they have them but ERM would need to request for Contract management plans or supplier plans through AIIB/IFC as they are confidential documents.</li> <li>• KTZ mentioned that they had requested a supplier management plan from Integra, but Integra refused to share this with them. KTZ mentioned that they are aware that the metal is imported from Russia.</li> <li>• KTZ informed that there is PPE training and that there is a log registration of PPE given to workers.</li> <li>• KTZ mentioned that there is a corporate level policy on safety plan and workers welfare.</li> <li>• On site, there are no Emergency drills, but they have EHS trainings.</li> <li>• There is also no Child Labour Policy but KTZ does not employ any child labour.</li> <li>• KTZ is aware that every morning the contractors and subcontractors conduct Toolbox meetings and training drills.</li> <li>• There is a grievance mechanism for lawn owners/users.</li> <li>• KTZ informed that during operation, they will install fencing barriers of protection against the railway line.</li> <li>•</li> </ul>
Cultural Heritage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• KTZ dose not have a cultural heritage policy in their project plan but knows about the law to stop construction activities should they find any archaeological objects of cultural significance.</li> </ul>

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH POLIGRAM

STAKEHOLDER	Project Manager of Poligram
DATE	06 November 2024
TIME	06:15 PM
SUBJECT	Key Informant Interview with Poligram Project Manager

Topic	Notes
Relationship between Poligram and KTZ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Poligram and KTZ have been working together for more than 10 years, with several projects concluded. The most important project to date is the Almaty Bypass.</li> <li>The respondent mentioned that workers usually enter periodical contracts with KTZ.</li> <li>The types of workers usually contracted: electrical and mechanical engineers, gas supply engineers.</li> </ul>
General information about Poligram	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Poligram has three main offices: Ataram (HQ), Almaty and Astana. The total workforce is 60-70 workers.</li> </ul>
Project specific engagements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There are about 60-70 workers engaged for this Project. Poligram also hired sub-contractors. There are an estimated 8 sub-contractors for this project, including Geology, Hydrology, for the EIA, for Cultural Heritage, etc.</li> <li>Poligram's employee gender ratio comprises of 60% male to 40% female workers. The female workers were engaged in developing the EIA, tree management plan, as surveyors, and engages in reporting.</li> <li>The youngest employee was between 22-25 years old, and the oldest employee was between 55-60 years old.</li> </ul>
Cultural Heritage study of Antique	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The alignment that Poligram had sent for which the 2023 study by Antique was conducted had not been the correct alignment, and thus the coordinates of the critical CH site was not the correct coordinates.</li> </ul>
General profile of workers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Higher education is required to become an employee of Poligram, including graduates of universities.</li> <li>Poligram have university scholarships where they hire young graduated (pre-graduation), where a stipend/salary is given to students (not less than the minimum wage)</li> <li>The main challenges faced by workers are usually project related challenges such as meeting project deadline (time-pressure).</li> </ul>
Grievance mechanism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There is no formal grievance mechanism for Poligram.</li> <li>If workers have complaints, they usually approach the Director.</li> <li>Common grievances include salaries, and colleagues arriving late to office or leaving early.</li> <li>These grievances tend to be addressed by speaking to the Supervisor, and if it is deemed to be true. The perpetrators tend to get a first warning.</li> </ul>
Contractual agreements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The contractual agreements with companies like KTZ can range from 2-3 days for a specialist, to 2-3 months, depending on the unique qualifications of the engineer and the specifications of the project</li> <li>60% of the employees are permanent staff</li> <li>40% are subcontracted</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In case the work or project is completed, the sub contractor might be able to continue in the project subject to the client's request.</li> <li>• If the subcontractor is found to have made mistakes in the project, there could be punishment in the form of a payment reduction (less than 0.5%).</li> </ul>
Retrenchment Policies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• If an employee is retrenched, Poligram is obliged, by the legislation, to pay up to 3 months of salary to the retrenched employee.</li> </ul>
Specific grievances or concerns by Poligram employees when working with KTZ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regarding this Project, the time-pressure created by KTZ is highlighted as a common complaint when dealing with KTZ. However, the respondent reinforced that this is not uncommon. It happens in all projects.</li> </ul>
Health benefits / checkups by Subcontractors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• According to the legislation, the employer provides a check-up to workers.</li> </ul>
How important is KTZ as a Client	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is the largest and most important Client.</li> </ul>
Incidents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There have been no reported incidents.</li> </ul>
Key challenges for Poligram	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The competition is high. Poligram won this project through a tender system. The legislation requires a tender process.</li> <li>• He is unsure how many companies were in the bid for this Project.</li> </ul>
Is KTZ involved in the hiring of Poligram's sub-contractors?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, and this typically happens before KTZ and Poligram sign the contract after the tender process.</li> <li>• KTZ requests the document list of engineers and their qualifications.</li> <li>• KTZ is involved in the approval of selection of sub-contractors.</li> <li>• Regular checkups are done with KTZ and with the subcontractors specialists.</li> </ul>

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW WITH A LICENSED VALUATOR IN TALGAR DISTRICT

STAKEHOLDER	Licensed valuator based in Talgar District
DATE	06 November 2024
TIME	3:30 PM
SUBJECT	Land Valuation in Kazakhstan

**General Information:**

The respondent mentioned that she has been a licensed Valuator since 2011. When asked how Valuators are engaged by the Government, the respondent replied that her company is an independent company and submitted a proposal based on a tender released in Talgar on 05.06.2024.

Topic	Notes
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>What is the role of a Valuator?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Valuator reviews the documents prepared by the Akimats to value certain land plots. The Akimat is their client so it is their role to prepare the necessary documentation for the valutors to take for assessment. The valutors are engaged in real estate and give valuations.</li> <li>When asked how many people are involved in the valuation process and what are their roles and responsibilities, answered that, in her firm, typically four people are involved in the process: one for observation, one for document review, one for document preparation and to take part in the tender process and conduct the calculations. Overall, the process usually takes 2 days: 1 day to visit the plot, and the other day to prepare the report.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Technical questions regarding valuation process</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The market-based approach and comparative approach are both used, however various factors are considered.</li> <li>When asked what is assessed during compensation, she responded that improvement of land (ie, fences), physical structures, trees, plants, crops are all taken into consideration.</li> <li>When asked to describe the comparative method and the negative coefficients (-10% or -12.5%) observed, she answered that land plots and reviewed and their prices compared to analogous land plots in the market, with similar landscape and adjacent roads. The factors to determine the negative bargain value are derived from two formulas: a collection of articles and "Vlasov's methodology".</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Disputes on valuation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>When a landowner disagrees with the compensation amount, the landowner would apply to court, and that the valutors do not get involved after this process, and in most cases, is not kept informed on what the next steps of the process is.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Regarding overall concerns regarding the Project's potential impacts in the Region</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Respondent stated that she had no overall negative concerns on the project, and that it would bring positive economic benefits to the community.</li> </ul>

## KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW LICENSED VALUATOR IN ZHAMBYL DISTRICT

STAKEHOLDER	Licensed Valuator based in Zhambyl District
DATE	07 November 2024
TIME	12:00 PM
SUBJECT	Valuation Process in Kazakhstan

**General Information**

The respondent has been a licensed Valuator for over 30 years.

Topic	Notes
What is the role of a Valuator?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The general roles and responsibilities of a valuator includes the evaluation of assets and properties. The general process of valutors would be to apply for a Tender. The valuation process typically takes 15 days (5 days to get the legislative documents) and another 10 days for land survey and valuation and the preparation of documents. Valuation reports can vary between 20-40 pages.</li> <li>The respondent was not aware the number of competitors involved in this particular project.</li> </ul>
Technical questions regarding valuation process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The approaches that should be used when valuing a land plot are in the scope's terms of references. Each plot's technical specifications are attached in the asset ownerships papers. The current quality of the assets are also included as technical aspects. Structures, crops and trees are valued through comparison with other land plots with similar assets.</li> <li>Regarding the negative coefficients (-10% or -12.5%), the respondent stated that there are three approaches (comparative, expense and income) and that Kazakhstan has a specific legislation and approach for valuating a land plot. When asked to clarify, he mentioned that the coefficient can vary – if an asset is more liquid, they can add 10%, and he stated that for the valuations for this project, he did not use -10% coefficients and used -3% to -4% instead.</li> <li>ERM could not obtain a copy of the valuation report as it was confidential and to request this from the Akimat.</li> </ul>

## FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION IN KAZYBEK BEK

STAKEHOLDER	Focus Group Discussion in Kazybek bek
DATE	05 November 2024
TIME	10:00 AM
SUBJECT	Focus Group Discussion in Kazybek bek (10 people)

### General

1	What is the group profile	<p>The participants in the Focus Group Discussion were not owners or users of the project affected areas, but they were residents of the village.</p> <p>The participants comprised of 4 women, 6 men (including the Akim).</p> <p>The women seemed to be around 40-60s, of working adult age.</p> <p>The men seemed to be all of retired age, with the exception of the Akim.</p> <p>Each person in the village is granted 100 sqm of land, where 50 sqm is reserved for the home, and the other 50 sqm is reserved for agriculture.</p>
2	Profile of project-affected persons	<p>90% of the landowners of the Project are not living here, even before the project started.</p> <p>In Kazakhstan, there are no restrictions on who is the owner. Owners can buy land and live anywhere within Kazakhstan.</p>
3	Other general information of the village	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. There is an electrical company that does water treatment in the village</li> <li>2. There is one hotel with 8 rooms.</li> <li>3. There are two restaurants (that are usually catered for events – conferences)</li> <li>4. Construction is expected to be complete by 2026 in Kazybek bek station.</li> <li>5. The frequency of update of population is calculated in the census 2021.</li> <li>6. There are about 235 private cars (end 2023), and in 2024 the figure is estimated at 280 private cars.</li> </ol>



		7. The population is estimated at 7100 people.
<b>Livelihood</b>		
4	General livelihood data	<p>A typical house engages in farming.</p> <p>A household can have a maximum of 50 sheep; and a maximum of 2 cows.</p> <p>When herding livestock, a farmer can send up to 300-350 livestock to pastureland. They leave their homes at 8am and return 1 hour before sunset.</p>
5	Estimated employment data of the village:	<p>There is 1 school (with all 11 grades) with over 100 teachers (90% women teachers).</p> <p>There are 3 kindergarten (90% women teachers).</p> <p>A 500kv station (with over 50-60 workers) (men and women workers, with women taking on more administrative roles – distribution of genders unclear).</p> <p>1 hospital (50 workers) (men and women workers - distribution of genders unclear but with women taking more admin and nursing roles).</p> <p>1 railway station depot with electrical and mechanical jobs</p> <p>1 stone treatment plant (130 workers, or 170 total including “foreign workers” – distribution of genders unclear but with women not engaged in the heavy duty but more in the packaging or “desk-based”) – the investor of this plant is Chinese.</p>
<b>Project related impacts</b>		
6	Villager’s expected advantages created by the Project:	<p>Job creation, small businesses profit from the surrounding activities.</p> <p>Small spare parts shops are opened.</p>

7	Expected positive impacts for Women:	For one women respondent, her son just graduated from college. So there will be more employment opportunities for him.
8	Discrimination towards women	<p>When asked whether there was any discrimination towards women, all the men answered that men and women are equal.</p> <p>When probed by ERM to let the women respond, the women responded that in Kazakhstan, they have their own national traditions. She acknowledged that the head of the family are typically men, and that, she would accompany her man to the Mosque and follow his decisions. They mentioned that in their family, they have fathers and husbands. However, they reaffirmed that they have no limitations, and are free. They stressed they are democratic.</p> <p>There exists an association for women in the village.</p> <p>There also exists an association for veterans (men and women), who are responsible for the younger generation. They provide <i>informal</i> consultation and mediation services in support of older and younger generations.</p>
9	Employment opportunities for women	<p>The group stressed about the school has employed 100 teachers and 90% comprise of women.</p> <p>There is a cultural palace where workers are ladies and men (9 workers – gender distribution unclear).</p> <p>There exists an <b>association of mothers</b> (1 women respondent was in this association and works at the Cultural Palace as well.</p>
10	Biodiversity impact	<p>They highlighted potential biodiversity impacts specifying impacts on turtles and lizards.</p> <p>The change of landscape with the increase of height from earthworks could pose risks.</p> <p>The group also highlighted seasonal change, including flooding risks, and these could have social impacts and could impact the railway bed.</p>

		<p>The group suggested having barriers for animals and were not aware of the locations of the proposed cattle passages.</p> <p>The group stressed that there was a lack of information disclosure, and that KTZ should show them the way of the cattle passages after the project has been complete.</p>
11	Impacts on cultural Heritage	The group stated there was no cultural heritage sites affected by the project.
12	Impacts on livelihoods due to the project construction?	<p>The group responded that they did not feel any impacts on livelihoods as they are on the other side of the village.</p> <p>The only concern they had was on 'dust' and their request would be for the construction companies to control dust.</p>

#### Grievance mechanism

13	General understanding of grievance mechanism	<p>Regarding Grievances, the group responded that the authority of the Akimat educates the community how to use electronic mobile apps for the submission of grievances.</p> <p>One concern was on land and physical structures.</p> <p>Another concern was on the valuation process and on the cadastral and market assessments.</p> <p>During the design stage, the design and cadastral numbers used gave difference coordinates (Akim mentioned this).</p> <p>The Akim mentioned that the concerns of the people were then clarified as the previous designs and cadastrals were wrong.</p>
14	Examples of grievance review	<p>A fence is built for livestock as these are suffering due to road and train accidents.</p> <p>In Akmola street, there are 15 families. The street is located behind the existing railway. The group is proposing that sound proof screens are built on that street as there have been grievances.</p>

#### Other comments

15	There are no issues with green and dry fodder for livestock feeding.
16	If there is a dispute amongst people, normally they could go to Court. However, in Kazybek bek, they would first go to the <b>Association of Veterans</b> .
17	<p>Overall, the group suggests that the village will have big advantages thanks to the project.</p> <p>An unloading terminal will be developed which will have international, internal, goods and regional routes. Kazybek bek has the capacity of a regional station.</p>

## FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION IN OTYGEN BATYR WITH LIVESTOCK, AGRICULTURE, GRAZIER OWNERS AND USERS)

STAKEHOLDER	Focus Group Discussion in Otygen Batyr, Iliy District
DATE	12 November 2024, 13 November 2024
TIME	13:00 PM, 12:00 PM
SUBJECT	Livestock, Agriculture, Grazier-- Owner and Users (3people)

General		
1	How many people work as agriculture and livestock farm workers in the village/akimat?	10% of the village population
2	Do workers engaging in agriculture and livestock live in the village of affected land plots of the project or nearby villages?	Live nearby in the village
Livelihood General		
3	How long do most employed workers work on the farm?	Usually Seasonal work
4	Have there been any changes to the farm size/activities in the past years since most were employed?	Change in the type of produce grown - small farms now grow mainly corn.
5	As farm workers/graziers, how economically dependent are you for the land plot / area that is affected by this project?	There is no problem finding work in another country
6	Do workers continue to work on the farm as before, after the Project land acquisition?  If not, were some people laid-off?	Now fewer workers are needed
7	What is the average daily/weekly/monthly wage? Men/women, separately	<p>Agricultural farmer: Men___200 thousand tenge____ Women___200 thousand tenge __</p> <p>Livestock farmer: Men__150 thousand tenge____ Women___no info___</p> <p>Grazer: Men___250 – 300 thousand tenge (tractor drivers), excluding fuel____ Women___ no info ____</p>
8	<b>For Agriculture:</b> What type of crops are grown in the land plot? What are the different activities/season?	<p>Mainly livestock - sheep, cows, horses.</p> <p>If sheep - then 300-500 heads. It is difficult to keep cows on this land, because it is risky farming (drought is possible). Horses about 50.</p>

	<b>For Livestock/Graziers:</b> Which type of livestock graze the land? What is the number of livestock per farmers? What are the different activities (daily/seasonally)	
9	Do farmers usually have other income generating sources?  What are the other income generating sources for you?  List 3 by Income earned and time spent	Difficult to answer  Main sources of income (per month/per year): 1. (% of time spent on site ____) 2. (% of time spent on site ____) 3. (% of time spent on site ____)  
10	Which are the main economic activities undertaken by your community?	Agricultural, trade, employment, teaching, taxi, etc.
11	<b>For everyone:</b> Do individuals in this group own any assets? What are the typical assets owned by you (land, property, etc.)?	Land and real estate, cars

#### Livelihood Affected After Project

12	What is the percentage of impact / affected area (ha) of land that will be affected from this project?  How significant is this and will it affect your livelihood?	Income will decrease, because some people will have about 50% of their land taken away.
13	If the land you work on / graze on / farm on is being bifurcated, what are the consequences for your livelihood?	Reduction in earnings
14	<b>For workers:</b> After land acquisition, was there a risk of losing employment from the commercial farms? How many have lost their livelihood?  Are other similar jobs easily available?	Most of the jobs were saved, there are no big problems finding work in this industry
15	<b>For workers:</b> Are there labour protection measures for commercial farm workers who lose their livelihood due to land acquisition?  Are there employee/worker benefits?	There are no strong protective measures.

	<p>What are the labour protection measures for commercial farm workers in general?</p> <p><i>(Document difference on women and men answers)</i></p>	
16	<p><b>For owners:</b> What is the percentage of impact / affected area (ha) of land that will be acquired?</p> <p>Will this significantly impact your land plot?</p> <p>Will you experience land fragmentation? If yes, how will this affect your livelihood?</p>	Around 50% will have a significant impact
17	<p><b>For owners:</b> During land acquisition, were you compensated for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Assets fixed to land</li> <li>• loss of income/livelihood</li> <li>• (If crops/trees were cleared) for the crops/trees present?</li> </ul>	Only for assets
18	<p>How many days of work do you do on the farm per month/per year? Men/women</p>	If it is livestock farming, there is no free time. Usually farmers do farming and livestock farming, so there is no free time left.
<b>Social Status</b>		
19	Are men and women given equal opportunities to work on the farm?	Women are usually milkmaids, while men operate agricultural machinery and work in the fields.
20	<p>What is the average level of education?</p> <p>Any specialized training?</p>	Average level of education
21	<p>Are there opportunities for farm workers in other sectors? Examples:</p>	If the land is not taken care of, it can be confiscated within 3 years if the land is not used.
22	<p>What are the risks faced by farm workers, at the household level? At the community level?</p> <p>Have these increased/decreased in the past 10 years?</p> <p>Please explain reasons for the change.</p>	<p>No government assistance, especially needed during drought.</p> <p>Unstable market for meat and other products</p> <p>Shortage of diesel fuel during sowing</p>

Access to Services:		
23	<p><b>Workers:</b> What supports are available for farm workers who have lost their livelihoods</p> <p><b>Owners:</b> What other supports are available for farm owners who have lost their livelihoods (Support from services is different from land compensation)</p>	No support
24	Has anyone here benefited from these programs?	
OHS for farm workers		
25	<p>Have there been any past incidents related to farm working?</p> <p>Can anyone share an example how this was solved?</p>	Injuries from heavy machinery are possible, but rare.
26	Any particular risks for men?	Risk of diseases associated with microbes and viruses (brucellosis), working outdoors in cold and heat.
27	Any particular risks to women?	Risk of diseases associated with microbes and viruses (brucellosis)
Project related impacts- perceptions on industry, expectations and concerns		
28	<p>What are the community perceptions of the Project's potential negative impacts?</p> <p>How many have already happened?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pollution (air / water / noise)</li> <li>• Biodiversity</li> <li>• Disruption to infrastructure and traffic</li> <li>• Risk to livestock (accident)- rail or road traffic</li> <li>• Worker influx</li> <li>• Community Health and Safety</li> <li>• <b>Noise</b></li> <li>• Increased traffic</li> <li>• Disruption to income / employment</li> <li>• Generation of waste</li> <li>• Loss of land / assets/ livelihoods</li> <li>• Landscape, Seascape, and Visual impacts</li> <li>• Others (please specify)</li> </ul>
29	What are the community perceptions of the Project's potential positive impacts?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Infrastructure improvement</li> <li>• Creation of job opportunity</li> <li>• Community Development</li> <li>• Others (please specify)</li> </ul>
30	<p><b>For all:</b> Does the construction activity, and associated noise and pollution, affect how farms are operated?</p> <p><b>For livestock/graziers:</b> How do the cattle respond to these disturbances? Does it affect your business</p>	<p>Land fragmentation affects access to part of a land plot. More difficult for agricultural activities. For cattle, this is an unnecessary negative impact. The fence will only be at the station</p>



	<b>For all:</b> If yes, what measures are in place by KTZ or District Akimats to mitigate the negative affects?	
31	<b>For livestock/graziers:</b> Does the change in landscape, affect the grazing pattern for your cattle?	Difficult to answer
32	<b>For livestock/graziers:</b> Six cattle bridges will be built along the Project.  Can your cattle accommodate/adapt to the changing landscape and is this an effective mitigation solution to allow cattle to continuously roam across the landscape?	People don't know where the cattle crossings will be
<b>Community improvement</b>		
33	What are the service(s) that needs the most improvement in this community?	Improving the fuel supply situation during the most active agricultural season. Developing support measures for farmers. There used to be subsidies for agriculture, but not now. It's difficult without subsidies.

## FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION IN OTYGEN BATYR

STAKEHOLDER	Focus Group Discussion in Baiserke, Otygen Batyr, Iliy District
DATE	13 November 2024
TIME	15:20 PM
SUBJECT	People who lease from Government land (2 people)

General		
1.	How many people own livestock or agriculture farms in the village/akimat?	It's hard to say.
2.	How many people lease land from the government in the village/akimat?  What is the % in leasers from government vs. renters from private vs. owners.	About 30% private property, 10-15% rent from private individuals, the rest about 50% rent from the state
3.	Are most leasers from the government from this village or nearby villages? If not, where do most leasers come from originally? Which district/region/country? What was the reason for moving here?	Usually these are those who live nearby.
Lease terms and conditions		
4	How long do lease terms from land leased by the government usually last until?  Are there options for long term lease vs. short term lease? Which options do leasers usually go for?	The state leases agricultural lands for only 49 years
5	Are there different loan repayment terms for leasing long term vs short term?  If yes, what are the differences?	It's difficult to answer, but in general the conditions are similar.
6	Do agriculture farmers typically lease long term or short term?  Do livestock farmers typically lease long term or short term?	Most often, long-term rentals.
7	When the government acquires fully or partially leased land, how quick are they in providing the amount of acquired land through reconfiguration or replacement plot?	Compensation is due if the field is sown with something (the value is assessed by an appraiser), and compensation is also due for buildings (for example, buildings for keeping animals). Damages are paid depending on the type of product. For example, the cost of potatoes is compensated for 1 year, alfalfa (clover) - for 3 years, and so on. This is

		prescribed in the law on appraisal activities.
Livelihood		
8	Do leasers typically own any assets? What are the typical assets owned by renters (land, property, etc.)?	Real estate, equipment, other lands
9	What are the other income generating sources for leasers? List 3 by Income earned and time spent	Difficult to answer
10	Which are the main economic activities undertaken by leasers in this community?  What employment status and types of employment usually undertaken by the sector?	Mainly agriculture, also trade in various goods
11	What is the percentage of impact / affected area (ha) of land that will be acquired on the land that you lease?  Will this significantly impact your livelihood?	In the case of those surveyed, they will lose no more than 10-15% of their land. This will have a negative impact on their income, but not critically.
12	For agriculture leasers What type of crops are usually produced? What is the average income earned out of 1 ha for agriculture crops?  For livestock leasers How many cattle is typically managed? Open grazing or stall feeding? (state by type and season)	Alfalfa (clover), corn, cabbage, carrots, potatoes, watermelons, pumpkin
13	During land acquisition, were leasers compensated for the following: Assets fixed to land (perhaps renters built farm structures) loss of income/livelihood (If crops/trees were cleared) for the crops/trees present? Such as:  Did the compensation include all of the above?	Compensation is due if the field is sown with something (the value is assessed by an appraiser), and compensation is also due for buildings (for example, buildings for keeping animals). Damages are paid depending on the type of product. For example, the cost of potatoes is compensated for 1 year, alfalfa (clover) - for 3 years, and so on. This is spelled out in the law on appraisal activities.  For livestock - only provision of other land.
14	How dependent are leasers for the land plot / area that is affected by this project?  As a livestock farm owner  As an agricultural farm owner	Finding other good land to rent is very difficult - the main difficulty is finding land with a source of water.
15.	When the government / RoK takes possession of a land, do renters typically:	<b>Move to another land plot in the village</b>  <b>Move within the same district</b>

Move to another village in another district

### Fodder – Food for cattle

16.	Where do green and dry fodder come from?  Are there separate assigned areas for summer / winter (different seasons) livestock grazing? And do you use them?	People most often prepare hay themselves on their plots (on part of the plot).  Outside the mountainous areas, cattle stand in a stall for part of the winter. In the warm season, grazing on the land plot, the grazing place changes in order to maintain the quality of the land.
17	Do livestock farmers grow it or buy it in the market? Where is it grown and have the prices changed?	People most often prepare hay themselves on their plots (on part of the plot).
18	Is there still adequate <u>quality</u> fodder supply available? Is there adequate land for open grazing?	Enough

### Social Status

19.	Do you think agriculture livestock farmer men and women are given equal opportunities?	Yes, but agriculture, especially livestock farming, is difficult work and unattractive for women.
20.	What are the risks faced by agriculture and livestock farmer women, at the household level? At the community level?  Is there support available to women who are at risk/have been affected? What kind of support?	Risks of disease due to animal diseases (but this is a common problem for both men and women).  There is little support from the government.
21.	What is the average level of education? Any specialized training?	Secondary and higher education, education in the field of agronomy is required first of all, as well as technical knowledge.
22.	What are the main problems faced by agriculture or cattle farmers in general?  What do you think the reason for this is?	Unstable demand for products, problems with hiring seasonal workers (expensive), problems with droughts. Problems with fuel during the beginning of the season and harvest

### (OHS) for farm workers

23	What are the number of past incidents and tracking, remedies and post-accident support for farm workers?	There are few cases of injuries. This is mainly due to careless handling of agricultural machinery.
24	Any particular risks for men?	Diseases associated with contact with sick animals and injuries from agricultural machinery

25	Any particular risks to women in this sector?	Diseases associated with contact with sick animals
----	---	--

### Access to Services

26.	What are the main health problems faced by you in the community? <i>Ask the group to select the top three.</i>	Cardiovascular diseases Diseases of the musculoskeletal system
27.	Are there any associations / support groups for farmers?  If yes, which ones? To what extent you are benefited by these programs?	There is a WhatsApp chat with the akimat for farmers - assistance in selling products, buying and selling equipment.  There is very little other support, especially for small farms and individuals. Large farms can receive subsidies from the state.

### Project related impacts- perceptions on industry, expectations and concerns

28.	What are the community perceptions of the Project's potential negative impacts?  How many have already happened?	Pollution (air / water / noise) Biodiversity Disruption to infrastructure and traffic <b>Risk to livestock (accident)- rail or road traffic</b> Worker influx Community Health and Safety <b>Noise</b> <b>Increased traffic</b> Disruption to income / employment Generation of waste Loss of land / assets/ livelihoods Landscape, Seascape, and Visual impacts Others (please specify)
29.	What are the community perceptions of the Project's potential positive impacts?	<b>Infrastructure improvement</b> Creation of job opportunity <b>Community Development</b> Others (please specify)
30.	Has the commencement of the construction of the project already impacted your business?	It's hard to say yet, but it will most likely have a negative impact.
31.	Does the construction activity, and associated noise and pollution, affect how your farm is operated? How do the cattle respond to these disturbances?  If yes, what measures are in place by KTZ or District Akimats to mitigate the negative affects?	So far, the main negative impact is noise, which scares away animals. Plus, part of the land near the future railway is used for the movement of construction equipment. Also, during the construction stage, due to the fragmentation of some of the plots, it is more difficult to graze livestock.

		The Akimat or the construction company have not taken any action to reduce the impact
32.	For cattle farmers: Does the change in landscape, affect the grazing pattern for your cattle?	It has little effect, but fragmented areas make it more difficult to graze livestock.
33.	Six cattle bridges will be built along the Project. Can your cattle accommodate/adapt to the changing landscape and is this an effective mitigation solution to allow cattle to continuously roam across the landscape?	If the cattle tracks are close to the land plots, it will help the farmers. However, many people do not know where the cattle tracks will be.

#### **Community Improvement (open ended)**

34.	What are the service(s) that needs the most improvement in this community?	Training of personnel (tractor drivers, veterinarians), assistance with product sales, currently there are few subsidies. Insurance is poorly developed.
-----	--	--

## FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION IN OTYGEN BATYR WITH WOMEN IN ILIY DISTRICT

STAKEHOLDER	Focus Group Discussion in Otygen Batyr, Iliy District
DATE	12 November 2024, 13 November 2024
TIME	12:00 PM, 11:00 PM
SUBJECT	Women's focus group discussion (5 people)

General		
1.	How many (adult) women and men are there in the village?  How many women/men voters are there in the village?  How many widowed women in the village?	Find it difficult to answer
2.	Are there any women-headed households?  If yes, how many in the village?	Yes, some households are headed by women. Their number is difficult to say.
3.	What role do women play in: The household? The community? Local leadership/politics?	Agriculture, work in the city (Almaty, GRES). Directors of schools and kindergartens.
4.	For a day, how much time do women spend in doing domestic work?  Do men help women with domestic chores?	Women spend all their free time doing housework.  Men help with repairs and childcare.
5	Occupations of women (list 5-6 below starting with the most common one)	1. Livestock and crop production 2. Work in the city 3. Business 4. Teachers 5. Doctors 6. Trading for public markets 7. Food production 8. Beauty industry
6	On average how much time do women spend doing non-domestic work (occupation/livelihoods) Typical hours of work, start/end (record seasonally if this changes)	9-10 h
Leadership Roles		
7.	How many women are in leadership positions in the community?  What leadership positions do they hold?	School and kindergarten directors.  Business directors
Ownership		
8.	What are the typical assets owned by women in the family (land, property, jewelry etc.)?	Can own everything.

9.	<p>Are the ownership rights for girls and women defined?</p> <p>What right do newly-wed women have?</p> <p>Can women/girls inherit property?</p>	<p>Equal rights for men and women. The work in agricultural production is difficult and poorly paid, so women do not go there.</p>
10	<p>Are women invited to attend village level consultations/meetings?</p> <p>How many attend?</p> <p>Do they participate actively in meetings?</p> <p>Are women discouraged from attending some or most meetings?</p>	<p>Everyone is invited, equally for men and women</p>

### Social Status

11.	<p>Do you think men and women are given equal opportunities?</p>	<p>Same opportunities, depends on the person. After 40, women often prioritize family.</p>
12.	<p>What influence do women have in decisions made within the household? (e.g. marriage, children, other family issues; purchase/sale of property/assets?)</p>	<p>Equal rights, but depends on the family. Women are usually involved in all family matters.</p>
13.	<p>If there is a dispute to resolve between a husband and wife, how is this resolved? Who helps resolve it?</p> <p>What are the risks faced by women, at the household level?</p> <p>At the community level?</p> <p>Have these increased/decreased in the past 10 years?</p> <p>Please explain reasons for the change?</p> <p>Is there support available to women who are at risk/have been affected? What kind of support?</p>	<p>Violence against women in some families, but recently there is a law that protects women.</p> <p>In recent years, women have had more opportunities for self-development and self-care, more time for their hobbies.</p>
14.	<p>Is there domestic violence? Is it prevalent?</p> <p>Do women report these cases of domestic violence and where? What are the actions on such reports?</p>	<p>Violence against women in some families, but recently there is a law that protects women. Mostly problems in dysfunctional families (mostly alcoholism or if the family is single-parent). This problem is also partly related to mentality.</p> <p>They can contact the police, the Akimat. But women, because of their mentality, are often afraid to report problems in the family.</p> <p>the child can contact the school in a special department (juvenile inspectors and psychologists). Juvenile police</p>
15.	<p>What are the main problems faced by women/girls in general?</p> <p>What do you think the reason for this is?</p>	<p>Single-parent families (especially if there is no mother in the family) and alcoholism. This problem is also partly related to mentality.</p>



16.	What are the challenges and opportunities faced by young girls / women in this community? Please explain (e.g. Access to employment, higher education, Recreation, availability of personal time, and opportunity of engagement with other youth in the village, access to Mobile etc., participation in cultural activities)	There are no significant problems. It mainly depends on the women's aspirations.
17.	What wishes and hopes do you have for your daughters/young girls in the community and their lives?	They want their daughters to get good professions and have adequate husbands. There are no obstacles.
18.	Are there any women's associations / groups? What do they do? If yes, how many women are members? What is the nature of these associations (religious, occupational, social, political?)	There are no problems in Zhetygen and there are no problems in Aksay. There are no women's organizations

#### Access to Services

19.	What are the main health problems faced by women in the community? <i>Ask the group to select the top three.</i>	It's different for everyone. But oncology does happen, gynecological diseases, diabetes, joint problems.
20.	Are there any health programs in the area?  If yes, which ones?	There are programs specifically for women to prevent breast cancer and so on. In general, there are few state programs to support women's health. There are some private initiatives, for example, on healthy nutrition.
21.	What is the overall level of sexual education for young girls in the community?  Is there any stigma around the topic? Could you share more about the Kazakh tradition regarding this topic?	The topic of sex education is stigmatized and closed. In general it depends on the family. Stricter upbringing in more religious Muslim families. We have not discussed this issue much due to lack of time.

#### Child-health services and government support

22	Are there government/community/private support for creches, childcare for women in the workforce, including informal arrangements/grandparents, neighbours etc?	Financial support for families with many children. Overall there is little support.
----	---	---

#### Livelihood & Income

23	What are the income generating sources for women in the community?  Which are the main economic activities undertaken by women? (distinguish between domestic work and occupation/livelihoods)	Please describe the special roles of women below.  Teachers Doctors Trading for public markets Food production Beauty industry
	On the farm	Milkmaids
	Industrial Sector	-

	In small businesses (as small entrepreneurs)	-
	Full-time public sector	-
	Full time private sector	-
	Volunteering	-
	In trading / commerce activities	Salespeople, directors, managers, cashiers and other positions
24.	<p>How many women in the community are working in the formal sector?</p> <p>How many are working in the various industries described above?</p> <p>What types of jobs?</p>	<p>Trade in various goods - employs about 70+% of women (plus sometimes this is an additional type of employment).</p> <p>Education - about 40%.</p> <p>Beauty industry - about 20%.</p> <p>Agriculture – 3-5%</p>
25.	<p>On average, what is women's contribution to family income?</p> <p>Does it increase their status in the family or increase their say in the decision- making?</p>	<p>Depends on the family. 70 from male, 30 from female – where the family consists of people 50+, and the new generation up to 35 years old – the family budget is formed by a woman by 60-70%. In the middle class of the population, more women work.</p> <p>90% of women of working age work.</p>
26.	<p>Are there households where men or other family members migrate seasonally or annually for work?</p> <p>How does this impact on the family?</p>	<p>Less than 1% of the village works on a rotational basis</p>
27.	<p>What significant changes have taken place in women's role since previous generations? (10-15 years). Why?</p> <p>What changes do you see happening now and expect in the future? Why?</p>	<p>Kazakhstan Adopts Law on Women's Protection. Overall, Situation Only Improves</p>

#### **Farming (Agriculture, Livestock) (if farming community)**

28.	<p>1. How many women in the village/akimat are engaged in farming?</p> <p>2. Percentage of HHs where women are engaged in farming</p> <p>3. Percentage of HHs where women are engaged as paid farm workers (Kazakh women earn only 78% of men's wages)</p>	<p>Women are mainly milkmaids, accountants, cooks</p> <p>About 20% of women are involved in agriculture.</p>
29.	<p>Do women have ownership over land?</p> <p>What proportions of women in the village/akimats have their own lands?</p> <p>Is the women ownership over land is more common in certain social sub-groups?</p>	<p>Men often own land</p>
30.	What is the role of women in various agricultural activities?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Land preparation</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Buying of seeds and fertilizers</li> <li>• Sowing</li> <li>• Weeding</li> <li>• Harvesting</li> <li>• Winnowing and Packaging</li> <li>• <b>Taking to the market for sale</b></li> <li>• <b>Managing finance</b></li> <li>• <b>milkmaids</b></li> </ul>
31.	<p>What are the normal working hours for women working in the field?</p> <p>Are the wages equal for female agricultural worker?</p> <p>Are they separately paid or paid as a family?</p>	There was no time to discuss this question.
32.	<p>Is agricultural/farming produce used for self-consumption or selling in the market?</p> <p>What portion?</p> <p>Does this differ from crop to crop?</p> <p>Can you specify in terms of the crops that they grow?</p>	
33.	<p>Where are the fields located? Indicate distance and radius from the village.</p> <p>How far do women farm workers have to travel for work?</p> <p>Is the Farm labour work available throughout the year?</p> <p>Do you face competition with the migrant labourforce?</p>	
34.	<p>What are the main challenges faced by women farmers in the village/akimat?</p> <p>In terms of trends, is the number of women in agriculture increasing/decreasing? (past 10 years)</p>	<p>Little support for farming at the state and municipal level.</p> <p>Unpredictability of the agricultural market.</p>

#### **Fishing (if fishing community)**

35.	<p>Do the women engage in fishing in this community?</p> <p>How many women/men are involved in fishing?</p> <p>Do women and men do different types of fishing/have different roles?</p> <p>Or on an average how many families engage in fishing from a typical village/akimat?</p>	Less than 5% of the women are involved in fishing. It is mainly a male dominated occupation.
36.	<p>Where do people in the village/akimat fish?</p> <p>Do people in other villages fish in the areas you fish?</p>	Nearby rivers and lakes
37.	If fishing is done, are there specific seasons for the same or its year around practice?	All year
38.	What are the main challenges faced by female fishers in the village/akimat?	It is difficult to answer, as women do not do much fishing. It is mainly

a men's occupation (they like it more)

### Project related impacts – perceptions on industry, expectations and Concerns

39.	What are the community's perceptions of the Project's potential impacts?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pollution (air / water / noise)</li> <li>• Biodiversity</li> <li>• Disruption to infrastructure and traffic</li> <li>• <b>Risk to livestock (accident)- rail or road traffic</b></li> <li>• Worker influx</li> <li>• <b>Community Health and Safety</b></li> <li>• <b>Noise</b></li> <li>• Increased traffic</li> <li>• Disruption to income / employment</li> <li>• Generation of waste</li> <li>• Loss of land / assets/ livelihoods</li> <li>• Landscape, Seascape, and Visual impacts</li> <li>• Others (please specify)</li> </ul>
40.	What are the community's perceptions of the Project's potential positive impacts?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Infrastructure improvement</b></li> <li>• Creation of job opportunity</li> <li>• Community Development</li> <li>• Others (please specify)</li> </ul>
41	<p>Displacement by project:</p> <p>Have you experienced Disadvantages/discrimination/advantages, in the compensation process?</p> <p>Have you had access to Project GRM?</p> <p>If required, was there a stakeholder engagement/disclosure process?</p> <p>What were the impacts on livelihoods displacement?</p>	<p>There was no discrimination in compensation based on gender. Due to land fragmentation, farm income has decreased.</p>

### Community improvement (Open ended question)

42.	Which of the following community issue(s) you consider the most important in this community?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insufficient lighting</li> <li>• Poor quality of roads</li> <li>• Continue gasification</li> <li>• Traffic jams at the railway crossing (but this problem will be partially resolved when the project is implemented)</li> <li>• Shortage of schools - three shifts of study</li> <li>• Few hospitals and old ones</li> <li>• There are few public spaces for young people and children nearby.</li> </ul>
43.	What are the service(s) that need the most improvement in this community?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insufficient lighting</li> <li>• Poor road quality</li> <li>• public spaces for young people and children nearby.</li> </ul>

## COMMUNITY CONSULTATIONS ALONG THE PROJECT'S RIGHT OF WAY

STAKEHOLDER	Community Consultations along the Project's RoW
DATE	06 and 09 November 2024
TIME	Various
SUBJECT	Community Consultations along RoW (7 people)

	Consultation type, focus/stakeholder	Location
1	Village resident, tenant farmer (neighbour, but not affected directly by project land take)	Zhetygen (Zhetygensky rural district, Ili district) Zhanaarna Village (Zhetygensky rural district, Ili district)
2	Consultation with worker on livestock farm	Kosozen (Karaoisky rural district, Ili district)
3	Socioeconomic conditions - consultation with person from the village who lives and works in Almaty	Kosozen (Karaoisky rural district, Ili district)
4	Consultation with a land user affected by land acquisition – fragmentation. Brother is owner	Kainarsky rural district, Talgar district (no village name – just one house). Coordinates: 43.621529, 77.078737
5	Discussion with a shepherd for over 20 years	Aksai rural district, Ili district. Coordinates: 43.5813720, 76.6296370
6	Brief on-site meeting with a contractor from PTCM that handles earthwork	Aksai rural district, Ili district
7	Consultation with the Head of construction for KCT Bridges in 3 parts of the project, at sub-contractor's construction camp on land taken on rent from local land owners for the construction phase.	Karaoisky rural district, Ili district

### Zhetygen & Zhanaarna Village where one farm owner (not affected) was consulted.

Respondent's comments	He said the land belonged to a big land owner who rented-out land for cultivation to farmers (for a one year period, each time). He received compensation for the land and the rental agreement with the farmers was terminated. The tenant farmers moved after harvesting their crop (usually, they grow corn, hay, melon, watermelon, tomato, cabbage etc). These farmers can find other farmland to take on rent.
General observations of Zhetygen & Zhanaarna Village	Bridge construction <b>Pictures</b> Kosozen settlement. village near alignment. Observed a big school, another small school and hospital. Vantage point. 2 pictures of 2 bridges. borrow areas, grazing areas. "Sand processing plant" in the settlement.

### Livestock farm, Kosozen. Spoke to farm worker

Observations of farm worker	Grazing areas nearer the river have better quality grasses are suited to sheep and cows. Upper slopes with sandy areas and coarser grasses and are usually for horses. Sufficient areas for grazing. There are no prohibited
-----------------------------	--

areas for different people. There are seasonal changes in grazing areas. The construction is not affecting grazing areas. Cattle passes are being made under each bridge. Even during construction, areas for livestock to pass.

#### Chat with local resident (driver, male) from Kosozen Village

General profile of respondent	Respondent lives and works in Almaty but has land in the area (not affected by the Project land acquisition). choose to work after completing education.
General observations by respondent	Many people from the village work in Almaty or they have livestock. Most owners are not dependent on farming. Agriculture fields are not farmed by people from here, cultivators are from outside. It is more profitable to have livestock than farm. For farming larger land plot and money for investment is needed. But livestock does not need as much land and investment.
Employment opportunities	90% of the people (his estimate) work in Almaty. Both men and women work. No livestock work are done by women. All family members, not just women work on kitchen garden. The women mainly focus on childcare and housework, but can choose to take up external job opportunities, usually, as school teachers, at a super market, offices, hospital etc. Women typically do not work in construction, mining, or as drivers, on livestock farms etc.
Education levels	The parents try to push for all children to attain higher education. 90% of the children in villages have high school/college level education. Some get a university degree. Women may not pursue higher education degrees due to cultural reasons.

#### Consultation with resident user

General profile of respondent	Respondent is the brother of the landowner (owner is retired and stays in Almaty). The land size was 40 ha, 4 ha was acquired. Leaving 10 ha on one side of the track and 26 (with their house and livestock facilities o on the other side. There are 3 residents. Husband wife and daughter (adult). People bought this land 20-30 years ago at a low price as the land is poor quality, saline (?) and not fit for agriculture. The user uses it for grazing livestock (had 200 sheep but sold 100 so now 100 left- this is routine and not because of any land acquisition/Project related reason). The compensation went to his brother and was at market price.
Information on the owned land	Surrounding parcels of land are private and not government. They did not ask the Akimat for a land reconfiguration. They cannot sell the land as the size is too small (10ha). They are not connected to the water supply network or electricity grid.
General observations	Raised earthwork. The interviewers met the PTCM contractor for earthwork. 90% of the earthwork is done. Respondent have taken a farmland area on rent temporary for laydown and parking area.

#### Discussion with shepherd (more than 20 years) on horseback

General profile of respondent	Respondent has been a shepherd all his life. His older children work in Astana, younger ones are very young and in school. Shepherds are in demand and able to get work easily- they are in demand by livestock owners. He works for the owner of the herd.
General observations by respondent	Says no big changes that he can recall in the past 10 years. His work has remained the same as it was before. While there are military areas, but the shepherds know where the grazing areas are and only go to those areas as there is plenty of grazing land. No security guards observed/encountered by him.

**Consultation with the head of construction for KCT bridges in 3 parts of the project and his team (5 team members: 4 male, 1 female)**

General information	<p>KCT has 15-25 staff per bridge, for three locations of bridges.</p> <p>All members of the workforce are Kazakh workers, there are no migrant workers in 70-person staff.</p>
Healthcare	<p>Workers have medical insurance from company in addition to the govt insurance which is for all citizens. All workers regardless of site or office have the same insurance from the company. 5% women staff for food, cleaning and office work, but no site work.</p> <p>Initial Health and safety training is provided to all staff; they repeat the training every three months. If small accidents happen the team will discuss and improve the process, and retrain the staff. Have a register for recording incidents. No accidents last year on all the alignment. Minor incidents of injury like hammer hitting hand, small injuries etc., which are recorded</p>
	<p>Before special work (risk) the team of workers need to prep and get a health and safety engineer who will approve and advise on risk management, applicable certificates must be taken, appropriate PPE provided, only then can the work start.</p>
Code of conduct	<p>There is no written code of conduct for staff, but the company does have an Admission Order- conditions of work are subject to government regulations and rules. There is a person to train all workers about this and they have to agree to follow all rules.</p>
Fire safety policy	<p>There is a fire safety policy, and inspection have been done. The extinguishers installed and checked.</p> <p>The supervisor/driver for the ERM team is also responsible for H&amp;S and Fire safety from KTZ and confirmed that this was done.</p>
Associations - trade unions	<p>There are no trade unions in railway and road work. relevant for mine and metallurgy sectors.</p>
Use of security forces such as private security	<p>Each sub-contractor have to have their own security arrangements. These forces are only on camp and storage areas, vehicle parking etc. not needed on site. One or two per construction camp and only at night, not during the day. Guards are not armed. CCTV used at construction camp.</p> <p>No known incidents involving security. Only Kazakh nationals allowed to be used for security guards.</p>
Grievance mechanism	<p>There are no grievance mechanism in place. Workers can call the supervisor directly or WhatsApp KTZ. They do not have any formal arrangement within the subcontractors.</p>

## STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS – ADHOC FROM 28 OCT – 1 NOV 2024

STAKEHOLDER	Worker at worker accommodation
SUBJECT	Ad-hoc semi-structured interview with worker for Integra's earthwork subcontractor
LOCATION	Along the alignment, 1000m from centreline of project.

### Worker at worker accommodation

1	What is the respondent profile	The worker was interviewed in a labour camp for Integra's earthwork subcontractor.
2	General information about the labour camp	<p>The camp is built on existing farmland with an agreement between Integra's subcontractor and the farmer.</p> <p>There are two concrete buildings which accommodate for 9 bunk beds.</p> <p>There is a trailer with 6 beds and one room.</p> <p>There are 2 toilets, and 1 shower.</p> <p>They use a boiler – coal for water heating.</p> <p>There is 1 canteen.</p> <p>Waste is collected once a week by a subcontractor.</p> <p>The temporary workers come from different cities.</p>



STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS – ADHOC FROM 28 OCT – 1 NOV 2024

STAKEHOLDER	A land user of a land that has been fragmented by the railway
SUBJECT	Ad hoc interview with land user of a land affected by the railway
LOCATION	43.608841,77.060310

**Land user staying on land for free**

1	What is the respondent profile	Landowner is away and rented the house for the renter for free. Renter has to take care of agriculture land plot in return and take care of the horse. Not disturbed by the project, although within the AoI.
---	--------------------------------	---

## STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS – ADHOC FROM 28 OCT – 1 NOV 2024

STAKEHOLDER	A land user of a land that has been fragmented by the railway
SUBJECT	Ad hoc interview with land user of a land affected by the railway
LOCATION	Along the alignment, in Zhanaarna within 200m from the alignment 43.604515,77.019203

### Ad hoc consultation with a landowner of fragmented land

1	What is the respondent profile	The owner lives in Zhanaarna and is using the agriculture land plot across his residential unit. Before the land fragmentation, he could drive his agricultural truck through the field to reach the other side.
2	General concerns	His unit is adjacent to a highway – he cannot use the highway for his agriculture truck as it is prohibited. He is not aware of any temporary access roads to reach the other side of the agriculture land plot that has been fragmented by the construction of the railway. He wishes KTZ or Akimat could inform him. He has already raised this concern to the Akimat.

MINUTES OF MEETING WITH RAILWAY WORKER

STAKEHOLDER	Unidentified Railway Worker
DATE	29 October 2024
TIME	11AM
SUBJECT	Ad-hoc interview with Railway Worker at Kazybek bek Station

General		
1	What is the group profile	<p>Three workers were approached at Kazybek bek station for a spontaneous ad-hoc semi-structured interview. ERM described the overall project and proceeded with the interview. Two of the workers had 15 years of experience while the third worker had 3 years of experience in construction. They mentioned that there are many vacant positions in the construction industry as many had already retired.</p> <p>Two workers continued their shift and one worker stayed for the interview.</p>
2	Information about worker's employment	<p>According to the respondent, the working hours are 8 hours a day, from 8am to 5pm. Overtime is paid and the worker engages in overtime work. Regarding the structure of overtime payment, the worker mentioned that there is a coefficient of increased pay of 1.5 to 2 times the hourly salary during overtime work.</p> <p>Regarding leaves, the worker mentioned he worked 20 days a month (consecutively), followed by a 10-day leave. It was unclear if this arrangement was followed by other workers of other subcontractors, or if he had a special arrangement.</p> <p>The worker mentioned there was a labour agreement with KTZ, and he had access to medical benefits. Asked whether he knew of any child labour arrangements, he mentioned that due to the heavy nature of the construction work, he did not see any child labour.</p>

		The worker highlighted that, safety toolbox meetings were done every morning, where workers would be made aware and delegated their tasks for the day. Overall, the worker and his colleagues have undergone safety inductions and professional trainings.
3	Worker's perception about Project	The respondent described the overall working conditions as a railway worker. He described that the new railway will be helpful as it brings benefits to the community, such as increased jobs and welfare.

#### Grievance mechanism

4	Regarding Grievance mechanism	The worker showed an integrated mobile app called "KTZ HSE" monitored by the KTZ safety department where incidents/risks, tasks, and weather forecasts are updated daily. The app also allows for workers to raise their grievances, and worker's salary and pay benefits can also be accessed. The app has a confidentiality hotline. Although there is a grievance mechanism, the worker preferred to raise complaints to his direct supervisor first.
5	Past incidences	The worker mentioned there were no severe incidents and no reported fatalities.

#### Other information

6	Worker's accommodation	He mentioned that there are no designated worker accommodations, but the supervisor rents rooms nearby, and there are workers resting facilities.
---	------------------------	---

